TOURISM INFRASTRUCTURE AND ENTERPRISE ZONE AUTHOIRTY (TIEZA)
Validation Result of 2019 Performance Scorecard

Component			Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective / Measure	Formula	Weight		2019	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
SO 1 Contribute to Country's Competitiveness Thru the Development of Sustainable Tourism Zones and Supporting infrastructure										
SM 1 Management and Supervision of Sustainable Tourism Infrastructure Projects	Actual Accomplishment	10%	All or Nothing	Board-approved Feasibility Study on the Development of the Manila Cruise Port	Completion of the Final Report of the Feasibility Study and the TIEZA Board approving the same	0%	Board-approved Final Report on the Feasibility Study on the Development of the Manila Cruise Port	10%	• Secretary's Certificate on the revised project timeline • Memorandum of Agreement with ESCA Inc./AMH Philippines, Inc. JV • TIEZA Board Resolution No. R-29-06-19-D	Request for revision of the target is **APPROVED** in consideration of the Board-approved revised timeline and MOA for the conduct of the feasibility study. Based on the submitted Board Resolution, the TIEZA Board approved the Final Report on the Feasibility Study on 29 June 2019.
	Actual Accomplishment	10%	All or Nothing	Completion of Technical Due Diligence on the possible acquisition of the Hilantaagan Island as a TIEZA-owned Tourism Enterprise Zone (TEZ)	Completion of the Technical Due Diligence	0%	Unverifiable	0%	• Resolution No. R-04-12-18-E identifying the Hilantaagan Island as possible TIEZA-Owned TEZ and execution of technical due diligence • Executive Summary of the Findings and Recommendations based on the Technical Due Diligence	Request for revision of the target is **APPROVED**. However, the GCG cannot verify the actual accomplishment since the report submitted is undated. No other information was provided on the documents submitted regarding the date of completion of the Technical Due Diligence.

(Row label column: SOCIO-ECONOMIC IMPACT / CUSTOMERS *)*

Component			Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective / Measure	Formula	Weight		2019	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
SO 2	**Preserve Historical, Cultural, Religious and Heritage Sites and Develop Ecotourism Sites in Depressed Provinces with Strong Tourism Potential**									
SM 2 — Conservation of World Heritage Sites based on NCCA MOA	Actual Accomplish-ment	10%	All or Nothing	Issuance of Notice to Proceed for the Restoration and Rehabilitation of the Banaue Rice Terraces	NTP Issued 19 December 2019	10%	Issued NTP for the Restoration and Rehabilitation of the Banaue Rice Terraces	10%	Notice to Proceed dated 19 December 2019	Acceptable.
SM 3 — Development of Ecotourism Sites in Depressed Provinces	Number of Projects with Notice of Award / Total Number of Board-Approved Projects in 2018 <u>with Complete Detailed Engineering Design</u> (Based on Secretary's Certificate on the List of Board-Approved Projects in 2018)	10%	(Actual/ Target) x Weight 0% = If less than 90%	100%	1. Signed MOA for San Jose Boardwalk, Phase 2 (Thru TOF) 2. Sta. Rita Boardwalk – TIEZA still awaits for a workable design 3. Issued NOA for Mangrove Forest Walkway, Suirgao 4. Lantawan Ecopark	10%	0%	0%	• MOA for San Jose Boardwalk • Chronology of events, showing causes of delay for the Sta. Rita Boardwalk project • NOA for Mangrove Forest Walkway • NTP for Lantawan Ecopark • Secretary's Certificate showing Board-approved projects for the depressed provinces for 2018	The request to revise the formula is **APPROVED** considering that a TIEZA-approved Detailed Engineering Design (DED) is TIEZA's pre-requisite before advancing to the procurement stage. In this regard, the Sta. Rita Boardwalk project was excluded from the universe of the target, resulting to a total of 3 projects with TIEZA-approved DEDs. The findings on the three (3) reported projects are as follows: 1. San Jose Boardwalk. – MOA entered on 21 November 2019, but the same document was also stamped with the date 09 January 2020. The approval date cannot be determined.

Component				Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective / Measure		Formula	Weight		2019	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
											2. Lantawan Eco-Park. – TIEZA submitted the NTP but the same is dated 11 June 2020. 3. Mangrove Forest Walkway, Surigao. – The submitted NOA was dated 17 January 2020. Based on the submitted documents, none of the three (3) projects were issued with MOA/NOA in 2019.
SO 3	**Ensure Customer Satisfaction**										
SM 4	Percentage of Satisfied Customers	Number of respondents who rated at least Satisfactory / Total number of survey respondents	10%	All or Nothing	80% of respondents rated at least Satisfactory	Final Report Submitted for TIEZA's acceptance, showing TIEZA getting satisfactory rating from 90% of respondents	10%	92%	10%	• Final Survey Report and Certification of Quality Control from the third-party provider • Samples of accomplished survey questionnaires	Target exceeded.
		Sub-total	**50%**				**30%**		**30%**		

-1-

Component			Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective / Measure	Formula	Weight		2019	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
SO 4 Achieve Financial Viability and Sustainability of Assets										
SM 5 Improve Net Income	Total Revenues – Total Expenses	10%	(Actual / Target) x Weight 0% = If less than the 2018 Actual	₱2.29 Billion	₱2.698 Billion	10%	₱2.46 Billion	10%	COA 2019 Annual Audit Report	Exceeded target.
SO 5 Maximize Absoprtive Capacity Based on Approved Plans and Programs										
SM 6 Efficient Budget Utilization	Total actual disbursements / Total DBM-approved Corporate Operating Budget (net of Personal Services Cost)	10%	(Actual / Target) x Weight 0% = If 70% and below	90%	13%	0%	19%	0%	• Budget Utilization Rate Computation • DBM-Approved COB for 2019 • COA 2019 Annual Audit Report	Request to revise the formula to reflect appropriation utilization index is **DENIED**. The validated accomplishment is based on the Statement of Comparison of Budget and Actual Amounts based on the Audited FS for 2019 and DBM-approved COB for 2019. Of the total budget amounting to ₱3.67 Billion, only ₱700.04 Million were disbursed.
	Sub-total	**20%**				**10%**		**10%**		

FINANCIAL

Component			Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective / Measure	Formula	Weight		2019	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
SO 6 **Implement an Integrated Automated Information System**										
INTERNAL PROCESS **SM 7** Develop and Implement a New Integrated Automated Information System	Actual Accomplishment	10%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	1. Issuance of Notice of Award for Enterprise Resource Plan 2. Deployment and Implementation of: a. On-line Travel Tax Payment System (includes travel Tax Ticketing System); b. TIEZA Assets Individual Website & Extranet; c. Document Management System; and d. Communications System	1. In-house Software Development Approved Manpower Hiring to do software development 2. Signed MOA 3. Approved for Implementation 4. Launching of the Assets Website 5. Approved Acquisition Request – Thru DBM-Procurement Service Agreement	10%	Three (3) out of the Five (5) IT systems were deemed acceptable	6%	• Memo re: approval of manpower hiring to do Enterprise Resource Plan • Signed MOA for Travel Tax Ticketing System • Pictorial record with Attendance Sheets of the Assets Website Launching • Excerpts from the minutes of ManCom Meeting with Attendance Sheet, showing approval of the implementation of Document Management System • Purchase Request, Agency Procurement Request Form	Request to revise the rating system is approved. Validation details is presented in *Appendix 1*. While the reported accomplishment for the Online Travel Tax Payment System was accepted for purposes of this performance scorecard, we put into record COA's observation on the said project. Per Item 12 of COA Observation, *"TIEZA's payment collection system (PCS) customized by the CIS Bayad Center, Inc. (CBCI) was found to be unsound resulting in the uploading of understated Daily Collection Reports (DCRs) by P0.726 million; delayed reporting of collections amounting to P0.996 million; penalty charges amounting to P231,980 as of to date; and non-closure of Reference Numbers (RNs) with validity period of 24 hours."*

Component			Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective / Measure	Formula	Weight		2019	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
									and Disbursement Voucher for the Communication System	
SO 7 Implement Quality Management System										
SM 8	Attain ISO Certification	Actual Accomplish-ment	10%	All or Nothing	ISO 9001:2015 Recertification	TIEZA re-certified on ISO 9001:2015	10%	ISO 9001:2015 Recertification for new scope	10%	• ISO 9001:2015 Certification issued on 02 December 2019 • Initial Audit Summary Report	Target met.
		Sub-total	20%				20%		16%		
SO 8 Build and Strengthen Organizational Capabilities										
SM 9	Percentage of Employees Meeting Required Competencies	Actual Accomplish-ment[1]	10%	All or Nothing	Improvement in the Competency Baseline of the Organization	Improvement in the Competency Baseline	10%	*Unverifiable*	0%	• Final Report for 2018 and 2018 • Raw data of responses in excel file (self-assessment and manager's assessment • COA Annual Audit Report (AAR) for 2019	The report submitted indicates that the assessment covered the total population of TIEZA but did not disclose the actual number of employees covered by the assessment. Comparison of raw data responses in excel files for the self-assessment and managers' assessment showed a total

(LEARNING AND GROWTH)

---

[1] Improvement in the competency baseline of the organization shall pertain to the average percentage of required competencies met which can be computed using the following formula:

$$\sum_{b=1}^{B}\left[\frac{\sum_{a=1}^{A}\left(\frac{Actual\ Competency\ Level}{Required\ Competency\ Level}\right)}{A}\right]_b$$
$$B$$

where: a = Competency required, A = Total number of competencies required of position, b = Personnel profiled, B = Total number of personnel profiled

Component			Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective / Measure	Formula	Weight		2019	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
										of 433 and 434 respondents, respectively. On the other hand, the Executive Summary of the 2019 COA AAR stated that a total of 496 employees.

It was also noted that the baseline, which was the assessment conducted in 2016, utilized an assessment form with questions answerable by Yes or No; while for 2019, a 5-point Likert Scale was used. The final report did not mention how the differences were reconciled to provide a comparable result.

Lastly, the documents submitted did not disclose the required competency level per competency per employee. Absent this information, validation of the reported accomplishment cannot be undertaken objectively. |
| | *Sub-total* | 30% | | | | 10% | | 0% | | |
| | **VALIDATED RATING** | 100% | | | | 70% | | 56% | | |

DETAILS OF VALIDATION OF SM 7: DEVELOP AND IMPLEMENT A NEW INTEGRATED AUTOMATED INFORMATION SYSTEM

TARGET SYSTEM AND MILESTONE	PROPOSED REVISED TARGET	TIEZA REPORTED ACCOMPLISHMENT	GCG VALIDATION
1. Issuance of Notice of Award (NOA) Enterprise Resource Plan (ERP)	*None.*	In-house software development – Approved Manpower hiring to do software development	As reflected in the updated timeline, the target was retained and that the development of the ERP is targeted to be outsourced. TIEZA reported that the hiring of additional manpower for the software development was accomplished. Based on the submitted Memorandum dated 31 July 2019 by TIEZA-Management Information Systems Department (MISD) to the TIEZA Chief Operating Officer (COO), it was recommended to internally develop and customize the ERP on Human Resource Information System (HRIS). According to the MISD memorandum, although several off-the-shelf system vendors for HRIS were tapped, the users found that the required features needed by TIEZA is not present in the proposed system by the vendors. With this, the in-house development was recommended. The submitted Memorandum also presented a comparative cost-benefit analysis of the in-house development vs. outsourced system as well as the three developers who will undertake the development of the ERP-HRIS. It was also noted that the TIEZA COO affixed its signature on the memorandum, signifying approval of the recommendation therein. It is recognized that the change in the project implementation modality aims to ensure that the automated system is responsive to the requirements of the organization. In this case, the reported accomplishment was found <u>**ACCEPTABLE**</u>.
2. Deployment and Implementation of the following:	Issuance of Notices of Award for the following Projects:		

TARGET SYSTEM AND MILESTONE	PROPOSED REVISED TARGET	TIEZA REPORTED ACCOMPLISHMENT	GCG VALIDATION
a. Online Travel Tax Payment System (OTTPS)	a. Additional Payment Channel for OTTPS	Signed MOA	The target to implement the OTTPS is an offshoot of the 2018 target which is to Issue Notice of Award for Travel Tax Ticketing System. While it was confirmed during the validation that TIEZA entered into an agreement with DBP Data Center, Inc. (DCI) in 2018, there was no information that the system was already up and running at the time of the crafting of 2019 scorecard. Hence, the target for 2019 was pegged to the implementation of the system. In its motion for reconsideration, TIEZA requested to modify the target from implementation to the addition of new payment channel in due consideration that the system is now up and running. TIEZA reported to have entered into a Payment Collection Services Agreement (Agreement) with CIS Bayad Center, Inc. (CBCI) in 2019. A copy of the Agreement dated 24 May 2019 was submitted to attest the reported accomplishment. As provided therein, for a transaction fee of ₱50.00, CBCI shall accept payments for TIEZA products and services through the CBCI Payment Platforms (e.g., Over-the-Counter Payment through any of the Payment Collection Sites). It also involves the customization of CBCI's payment collection system to enable the collection partners to accept payments on behalf of TIEZA by developing a module in accordance with the Project Schedule to be agreed by the parties. Based on our research, a news article showed that the payment system developed by DCI was launched in 2018. It was further mentioned therein that the website for the travel tax payment was already accessible as of the writing of the said news article. Given that the OTTPS was already implemented in 2018, the shift from implementation of a payment system to outsourcing of another payment system development in 2019 is <u>ACCEPTABLE</u>. Considering the actual accomplishment and revision in the target

TARGET SYSTEM AND MILESTONE	PROPOSED REVISED TARGET	TIEZA REPORTED ACCOMPLISHMENT	GCG VALIDATION
			deliverable which is the addition of new channel, the target from implementation to NOA is **NOT ACCEPTABLE**.
b. TIEZA Assets Individual Website & Extranet (TAIWE)	b. TIEZA Assets Individual Website & Extranet (TAIWE) – In-house development; 100% implementation	Launching of the Assets Website	**ACCEPTABLE.** To attest to this accomplishment, TIEZA submitted documentation on the launching of the Assets Website and Online Booking on 25 November 2019 such as attendance sheet and photos during the said launching event.
c. Document Management System (DMS)	c. Document Management System (DMS) - NOA	Approved for implementation	TIEZA reported that the system was already approved for implementation. Considering this, the request to revise the target from implementation to NOA is **DENIED**. In relation to the reported accomplishment, TIEZA submitted a copy of a Memorandum from the Management Committee (ManCom) Secretariat which provided an excerpt of the minutes which transpired during the 07 October 2019 ManCom meeting. The memorandum provided the following: *"Management and Information Systems Department OIC, Ms. Raquel dela Cruz presented to Management Committee the In-House Development of the Document Management Information System for its approval. Excerpt of the minutes included the following:* *Management Committee headed by COO Paragas approved the presentation stating the system's importance and necessity to the organization, with the Implementation of the Document Management Information System to jumpstart at the Administration and Finance Sector and the Office of the Corporate Secretary as pilot offices to first implement the system. Moreover, the COO instructed Ms. Dela Cruz to*

Target System and Milestone	Proposed Revised Target	TIEZA Reported Accomplishment	GCG Validation
			provide him with a category listing (appendix) and description of all documents for uploading." Considering this representation, TIEZA was requested to submit a sample of a system-generated report or system screenshots to verify the actual implementation of the system. However, TIEZA only resubmitted a copy of the Internal Memorandum and the attendance sheet for the 07 October 2019 ManCom meeting. Foregoing considered, the reported accomplishment is **NOT ACCEPTABLE** absent valid proof of implementation of the DMS.
d. Communications System (CS)	d. Communications System (CS) - NOa	Approved Acquisition Request – through DBM-Procurement Service Agreement	TIEZA reported that the acquisition request thru DBM-Procurement Service was approved. TIEZA submitted an MISD Memorandum to TIEZA COO dated 28 November 2019 on the approval of the Purchase Request (PR) for the acquisition of the Microsoft Office 365 through the DBM Procurement Service. It was also mentioned in the memorandum that there is no need for the purchase to undergo the bidding process. It should be noted that the original target was to implement the project, however, TIEZA requested to modify the target to NOA. Given the reported accomplishment of TIEZA and representation that no bidding will be undertaken, the request to modify the target is **DENIED**. In relation to its reported accomplishment, in addition to the MISD memorandum, TIEZA also submitted copy of the Purchase Request dated 28 November 2019, Agency Procurement Request Form dated 20 January 2020 and Disbursement Voucher dated 20 January 2020. Considering that that actual implementation of the Communication System may only happen upon the purchase of the software, the reported accomplishment cannot be accepted. In addition to this, reported accomplishment cannot be given merit since the supporting documents do not show the actual

TARGET SYSTEM AND MILESTONE	PROPOSED REVISED TARGET	TIEZA REPORTED ACCOMPLISHMENT	GCG VALIDATION
			implementation of the Communication System purchased. Foregoing considered, the reported accomplishment was found **UNACCEPTABLE**.